

## Process & Protocols

### Tushar Allotments (Ten Mile/Pine Creek-Sulphurdale) Collaboration Operational Protocol

Operational Protocols outline the expectations and understandings of the group purpose, products, roles and responsibilities, decision-making and other important process components.

#### 1. Collaboration Foundation

- a. **Co-Sponsors:** Utah Farm Bureau and Grand Canyon Trust\
- b. **Participants:** Four permittees, Pine-Creek/Sulphurbeds Allotment; Ten Mile Allotment manager; seven representatives from the Fishlake National Forest (Forest Supervisor; Beaver District Ranger; Beaver RD range management supervisor; wildlife biologist ; ecologist; GIS specialist; NEPA specialist); seven appellant organization representatives; one representative each Beaver County Commission, Utah Division of Wildlife Resources, Utah Farm Bureau
- c. **Facilitation:** A neutral, third-party facilitator with a track record of having successfully facilitated multi-stakeholder collaboratives. The Collaboration participants will select their facilitator. The U.S. Institute of Environmental Conflict Resolution (USIECR) will assist or advise in ensuring that the principles for collaboration are understood and implemented.
- d. **Project name:** Tushar Allotments (Ten Mile/Pine Creek-Sulphurdale) Collaboration (Collaboration)
- e. **Purpose and need:** Collaboratively develop existing and desired conditions and management practices to be used in developing management plans for the Ten Mile and Pine Creek-Sulphurdale Allotments.
- f. **Scope and focus:** The Collaborative will address natural resource conditions and livestock management on the two allotments, including but not limited to:
  1. aspen and mountain mahogany recruitment
  2. a plan for re-establishment of suitable habitat for beaver on at least one stream within the Pine Creek-Sulphurdale Allotment

It is assumed by all parties that the efforts to improve natural resource conditions and reduce resource damage on these two allotments will be shared for similar or related problems in other Fishlake National Forest livestock allotments.

- g. **Legal, policy, and procedural parameters:** The Collaboration process, which seeks to identify and recommend broad-scale conservation strategies, is not subject to the National Environmental Policy Act, because the Collaboration's

recommendations do not constitute decision documents. The Collaboration process is not a Federal Advisory Committee Act Charter process. In addition, the Collaboration process does not represent a formal consultation with the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service and is, therefore, not subject to provisions of the Endangered Species Act.

- h. **End Product:** The Collaboration's recommendations will be used in developing management plans for the Ten Mile and Pine Creek-Sulphurdale Allotments. The spectrum of views among Collaboration participants, along with the recommended approaches, will be noted in the report, including areas of agreement and disagreement.

2. **Collaboration principles.** Collaboration participants agree to the following principles:

a. ***Informed Commitment***

Confirm willingness and availability of appropriate agency and Appellant organization leadership and staff at all levels to commit to principles of engagement; ensure commitment to participate in good faith with open mindset to new perspectives

b. ***Balanced, Voluntary Representation***

Ensure balanced, voluntary inclusion of affected/concerned interests; all parties should be willing and able to participate and select their own representatives

c. ***Group Autonomy***

Engage with all participants in developing and governing process; including choice of consensus-based decision rules; seek assistance as needed from impartial facilitator/mediator selected by and accountable to all parties

d. ***Informed Process***

Seek agreement on how to share, test and apply relevant information (scientific, cultural, technical, etc.) among participants; ensure relevant information is accessible and understandable by all participants

e. ***Accountability***

Participate in process directly, fully, and in good faith; be accountable to the process, all participants and the public

f. ***Openness***

Ensure all participants and public are fully informed in a timely manner of the purpose and objectives of process; communicate agency authorities, requirements and constraints; uphold confidentiality rules and agreements as required for particular proceedings

*g. Timeliness*

Ensure timely decisions and outcomes

*h. Implementation*

Ensure recommendations are implementable; parties should commit to identify roles and responsibilities necessary to implement agreement; parties should agree in advance on the consequences of a party being unable to provide necessary resources or implement agreement; ensure parties will take steps to implement and obtain resources necessary to agreement

3. **Methodology and scientific accuracy:** The Collaboration shall insure the professional integrity, including scientific integrity, of the discussions and analyses in its report and recommendations. The Collaboration shall identify any methodologies used and shall make explicit reference by footnote to the scientific and other sources relied upon for conclusions in the report/recommendations.

- a. **The Collaboration will conclude** by April 18, 2009. [Two years from the date of adoption of the Resolution]
- b. **Overall Process Timeline** (highlighted to show milestones for the Range-Wide Issues Collaboration):

Date	Event
6/11/2007	Tushar Allotments Collaboration convened
6/12, 14, 20 and 21/2007	Collaboration field visits to Ten Mile and Pine Creek-SupphurbedsAllotments
6/29/07	Collaboration Science meeting, Beaver
8/3/07	Wildcat Creek field meeting, Sulphurbeds Allotment
9/17/07	Collaboration meeting, Beaver
10/22/07	Facilitator Michele Straube selected by Collaboration
11/29/07	Collaboration meeting, Beaver
4/18/2009	Tushar Allotments Collaboration recommendations to be completed.

4. **Participation:** Participation in the Collaboration process is by invitation of Beaver Ranger District, Fishlake National Forest, and Appellants. Along with Collaboration participants, resource persons and others may be invited by the Collaboration to assist Collaboration participants in their deliberations. Other considerations for participation are listed below.
  - a. **Compensation:** It is anticipated that agencies or organizations that have the ability to sponsor participants will cover all appropriate costs (travel expenses and any other costs associated with their participation).
  - b. **Participant interests:** Participants have been selected to represent a broad diversity of interests, perspectives, and technical/scientific expertise. Participants are not viewed as formal representatives of individual organizations or constituencies, but are expected to work toward consensus recommendations and a final report. It is expected that participants will work to provide ongoing communication and exchange throughout the process with people/groups sharing similar interests.
  - c. **Participant selection criteria:** The following criteria will be used by the sponsors to select Collaboration participants:
    - i. Demonstrated knowledge, experience, and interest in the subject
    - ii. Affected by - or have an understanding about the effects - of the outcomes
    - iii. Brings a valuable and informed perspective
    - iv. Works collaboratively and constructively
    - v. Willing to think creatively about a range of solutions
    - vi. Contributes useful information to the process
    - vii. Respects scientific and documented evidence and methods
    - viii. Networks effectively with people or groups with similar interests
    - ix. Electronically accessible and capable of accessing relevant information from the internet
    - x. Availability and willingness to commit time and energy to the process
    - xi. Other considerations: a) ability to offer resources, real or potential, to support the process, c) individual participants may not meet every criterion, but each of these factors should be considered in their selection
5. **Quorum requirement.** There is no quorum requirement. The participants present and active at a given meeting have the authority and permission of the group to continue to work and make decisions and recommendations on behalf of the group. Participants cannot designate replacements to sit in for them if they are unable to attend meetings; however, those who are not present will attempt to provide their input (via documented meeting notes or other electronic mechanisms or through communications with other Collaboration participants) before a given meeting.\
6. **Roles and responsibilities**
  - a. **Collaboration participants:** The role of Collaboration participants is to bring their unique perspectives to the table, and to work collaboratively with other interests to develop recommendations for management of the Ten Mile and Pine Creek-Sulphurdale Allotments that will provide for natural resources health and native species diversity.

Participants are responsible for being informed about the issues, contributing useful and accurate information to the deliberations, and serving as an accurate and objective information conduit with others who have similar interests.

**b. Sponsors**

- i. **Beaver Ranger District, Fishlake National Forest:** The Fishlake National Forest is ultimately responsible for management decisions on the Ten Mile, Pine Creek-Sulphurdale Allotments and other allotments within the Fishlake National Forest.

Beaver District Ranger Terry Krasko has the responsibility to support and coordinate with the Fishlake National Forest, Facilitation Team to ensure that Collaboration milestones, commitments and communication needs are met .

District Ranger Krasko will also work with the Facilitation Team and Grand Canyon Trust on logistical issues, in organizing meetings, identifying meeting objectives, outcomes, agendas, and process.

- ii. **Appellants:** “Appellants” are comprised of seven conservation organizations that appealed the 2006 Final EIS and Record of Decision for Eight Tushar Range Allotments, including a representative from each of the following organizations: Grand Canyon Trust, Great Old Broads for Wilderness, Red Rock Forests, Sierra Club (Utah Chapter), Utah Environmental Congress, Western Watersheds, Wild Utah Project. As lead Appellant, Grand Canyon Trust has the responsibility to support and coordinate with the Beaver Ranger District and the Facilitation Team to ensure that Collaboration milestones, commitments and communication needs are met . Grand Canyon Trust will also work with the Facilitation Team on logistical issues, in organizing meetings, identifying meeting objectives, outcomes, agendas, and process.

- c. **Facilitation Team:** The U.S. Institute for Environmental Conflict Resolution is a federal program established in 1998 by the U.S. Congress to assist parties in resolving environmental, natural resource and public land conflicts. It is a program of the Tucson-based Morris K. Udall Foundation, an independent agency of the executive branch. Their role is to assist and advise in ensuring that the principles for collaboration are understood and implemented. They will assist the Collaboration to select a third-party neutral facilitator who, in partnership with the Institute Senior Program Manager, will constitute the Facilitation Team.

1. The Facilitation Team supports the participants, maintains the integrity of the collaborative process, and facilitates communication about the process among Collaboration participants and with the public.

2. The Facilitation Team is responsible for ensuring that the selection process for participants is neutral and impartial. The Team will seek to develop a design that maintains a collaborative and inclusive process.
3. The Institute is responsible for completing and distributing the Collaboration's final recommendations and report. The Institute will base the report on the collaborative work of Collaboration participants, and will seek to work with participants throughout the drafting process to ensure their views are adequately represented.

## 7. Groundrules

- a. Treat one another with civility, both within and outside the meeting environment
- b. Operate with integrity
- c. Maintain confidentiality
- d. Respect each other's perspectives- consider issues from others' points of view
- e. Focus on the future rather than belaboring issues of the past. Recognize and learn from the past, acknowledge the present, and recognize where we want to be in the future
- f. Be honest in communications among and about one another
- g. Support an open process
- h. Be outcome oriented
- i. Participate actively
- j. Be conscientious about identifying interested people and soliciting their input
- k. Silence cell phones and other electronic devices during meetings.

## 8. Decision-Making:

- a. **Process:** Decisions will be made by consensus whenever possible. *Consensus has been reached when everyone agrees they can accept whatever is proposed after every effort has been made to meet the interests of all participants. Participants have both the right to expect that no one will ask them to undermine their interests and the responsibility to propose solutions that will meet everyone else's interests as well as their own.* If consensus cannot be reached, areas of divergence, along with the reasons for the divergence, will be documented in the final report.
- b. **Kinds of decisions:**
  - i. **Operational decisions:** These decisions relate to Collaboration topics, process and schedule.
  - ii. **Strategy recommendations:** These decisions relate to the recommendations in the Collaboration's final report.

## 9. Communications

- a. **Confidentiality**
  - i. **Participants:** Participants will respect the confidential nature of any proprietary information or any other information participants identify as confidential.
  - ii. **Facilitation Team:** The Facilitation Team will not include confidential/proprietary information in Collaboration documentation.

Conversations/communications held in caucus with individual participants or participants with similar interests will be considered confidential unless otherwise identified by the participants in those conversations/communications.

- b. **Describing the Collaboration process to others:** Participants are encouraged to share accurate and objective information about the Collaboration process with other people. Meeting/workshop summaries and other interim products and briefing papers will be available to participants as communication aids. Participants are also encouraged to share the Collaboration website address and Facilitation Team contact information to enable people to locate information related to the Collaboration throughout the Collaboration process.

- c. **Process and mechanisms:**

- i. **Website:** The U.S Institute of Environmental Conflict Resolution will host and maintain a Collaboration website accessible through the Institute's website address. The Collaboration website will provide links to important documents, resource materials, contact information, and will serve other appropriate uses identified throughout the Collaboration process.
- ii. **Email:** Email/electronic notices will serve as the primary communication mechanism among participants and with the Facilitation Team. A current contact list, including email, USPS mail, and phone numbers of Collaboration participants will be maintained by the Facilitation Team. Contact information will not be released to other participants or the public without the written consent of participants.

In addition, key interested people who are not directly participating in the Collaboration will be invited to join an email list used to distribute updates and information on the Collaboration process and products.
- iii. **On-line survey tools:** These will be used by the Facilitation Team to solicit quick and specific information from participants relative to ongoing Collaboration processes and products.
- iv. **Working with the press:** Members of the press will generally not be invited to observe meetings. If members of the press arrive at meetings they will be allowed to remain, but will be asked to report without attribution. Participants may choose to accommodate interview requests outside of work sessions, but are asked to give due consideration to the effect their comments may have on other participants and the process. Participants granting interviews are asked to respect the confidentiality provisions of this Collaboration, and to utilize workshop documentation and other communication aids to provide as much accurate and objective information as possible to the press.

## 10. Documentation

- a. **Data**

All non-confidential data referred used to develop the Collaboration's recommendations will be retained on the Collaboration website, accessible to the public.

**b. Summaries**

**Meetings/workshops:** The Facilitation Team will prepare draft meeting summaries, including key discussion points, action items, and decisions/agreements (not a transcript). The summaries will be circulated to the Sponsors for review and comment. The Facilitation Team will incorporate comments as appropriate into the final summary. Collaboration participants will have the opportunity at the start of subsequent meetings to provide comments or suggest corrections to the final summary.

**Conference calls:** The Facilitation Team will record key discussion points, action items and decisions/agreements and circulate these notes to all participants for review and comment.

**c. Process record maintenance:** The Facilitation Team will maintain an electronic record and hardcopy file until completion of the process; complete files will then be shared with Collaboration sponsors.

**d. Recommendations:** The Institute is responsible for completing and distributing the Collaboration's final report, which will include recommendations. The Institute will base the report on the collaborative work of Collaboration participants, and will seek to work with participants throughout the drafting process to ensure their views are adequately represented.